



## The Potential of Batu City-Western Australia Partnership in the Fields of Agriculture and Livestock: Challenges and Opportunities

Dion Maulana Prasetya<sup>1</sup>, Nurul Qomaria<sup>2\*\*</sup>, Devi Ardiyanti<sup>3</sup>,  
Putri Ulfa Habibah<sup>4</sup>, Adila Putri<sup>5</sup>, Irma Hermayanis<sup>6</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Ph.D. (Cand) in Universiti Sultan Zainal Abidin, Malaysia

<sup>23456</sup>Department of International Relations, University of Muhammadiyah Malang

### Article Info

#### Article history:

Received September 12, 2023

Revised December 17, 2023

Accepted December 18, 2023

Available online December 22, 2023

#### Cite:

Prasetya, et.al. (2023). The Potential of Batu City-Western Australia Partnership in the Fields of Agriculture and Livestock: Challenges and Opportunities. *Global-Local Interaction: Journal of International Relations*, 3(2).

\*\* Corresponding author.

Corresponding Author

E-mail address:

nurullqomariaa28@gmail.com

### Abstract

*The objective of this essay is to assess the possibility of collaboration between Batu City and Western Australia in the field of Agriculture and Livestock. The author employed a qualitative research methodology to investigate the collaboration between Batu City and Western Australia. The study approach adopted was descriptive, focusing on providing a detailed account of the collaboration. The primary method of data gathering involved conducting interviews with government personnel from Batu City. Additionally, secondary material was gathered from reputable websites and periodicals, and subsequently examined within the concept of the Paradiplomacy. The researchers discovered a significant potential for collaboration between the two cities. Batu City excels in producing high-quality horticultural seeds that are exported to multiple countries. However, there is a drawback in the livestock sector due to the prevalence of diseases affecting animals. As a highly developed province, Western Australia has the capability to transfer technology to Batu City in order to enhance the quality and quantity of these two sectors. Regrettably, the collaboration's potential was limited to the exploratory stage due to the Batu City Government's subpar efforts in uploading the city profile. This hindered partners from fully recognizing the potential of Batu City. Hence, it is imperative to augment the human capital of the Batu City Government and enhance its systems and administration in order to effectively engage in paradiplomacy with overseas counterparts.*

**Keywords:** Batu City, Paradiplomacy, Western Australia

### Introduction

Batu City is located in the East Java Province, approximately 15 kilometers northwest of Malang City and 90 kilometers southwest of Surabaya City. The city is situated at an elevation ranging from 700 to 2000 meters above sea level, with an average altitude of 871 meters. The typical temperature in the city ranges from 11 to 19 degrees celsius (Hannyva, 2021). Batu is characterized by its predominantly mountainous and hilly topography, which contributes to its reputation for cold temperatures. The soil types found in Batu City include andosol, cambisol, latosol, and alluvial. These soils are rich in minerals resulting from volcanic eruptions, making them highly fertile.

The combination of this soil type and low temperatures in Batu City makes it ideal for agricultural and cattle enterprises, with the average relative humidity is 86%. Batu relies heavily on plantations as its primary economic activity. Due to favorable soil and temperature conditions, the majority of the population engages in gardening and animal husbandry. The city's picturesque natural landscapes further inspire the local community to

creatively manage these resources as a tourism destination. By integrating agriculture and animal husbandry, Batu aims to boost its Regional Original Income (PAD). The livestock and agriculture sectors play a significant role in boosting the income of Batu city. Consequently, the Regional Government of Batu city diligently manages these sectors, with additional support from planned programs initiated by the government, including those related to the creative economy and other forms of assistance.

Agriculture plays a crucial role in Indonesia's national economic development, as evidenced by its contribution to the formation of the country's Gross Domestic Product (GDP), employment opportunities, and the export of agricultural products to foreign countries. This, in turn, enhances Indonesia's collaboration with other nations (Pratiwi, 2018). Within Indonesia, there remains a significant amount of arable land, including the city of Batu. However, during the past three years, this land has seen a decrease in size due to the conversion of agricultural areas into residential and tourist zones. The agricultural land area in Batu is projected to be 4,777,988 hectares in 2022, representing a reduction of 200,000 hectares compared to the previous year (Radar Malang, 2023). In 2021, the population of senior farmers will amount to 21,706 individuals, but the number of young farmers is less than half of that. Nevertheless, the municipal administration initiated the 'Farmers Taruna Group' pilot project with the aim of enticing the millennial demographic to pursue careers as young farmers. This is due to the fact that agricultural commodities continue to be the primary source of income and sustenance for Batu. (Fajarwati, 2021). During his tenure as mayor of Batu from 2007 to 2017, Eddy Rumpoko devised the initiative "Batu City, Center for Organic Agriculture Based on International Tourism" with the objective of transitioning agricultural practices from conventional (non-organic) to organic farming. This is driven by the entrenched conventional farming practices implemented by experienced farmers under the guise of preserving tradition. Regrettably, this pattern exhibits a lack of environmental friendliness due to the utilization of pesticides, lacks sustainability, and yields suboptimal crop production when employing the intercropping method (polyculture). This program aims to boost the production of fruit, vegetables, rice, and secondary crops, while also establishing Batu as a prime example of a city with organic-based agriculture. This characteristic sets Batu apart as a destination for organic agricultural tourism among the various tourist options available in the city.

When examining the topography of Batu, it becomes evident that the agricultural sector presents significant prospects for the city. In 2019, the Batu city administration augmented the organic farming region within the city to encompass 20 sections, so resulting in a total of 200 hectares dedicated to organic farming. The Batu Agriculture Service's Horticulture Production Department previously said that the government's objective was to establish two new organic farming areas annually. As part of this initiative, obtaining organic area certification was identified as a crucial step for the Batu government. The requirements for organic land areas encompass organic land mapping, product specifications, pest and fertilizer management, agricultural product testing, and cessation of chemical fertilizer usage (Sofya, 2019).

In addition, the demand for organic agricultural products from Batu City consistently grows over time, surpassing the level of output. Hence, the Department of Agriculture is endeavoring to optimize the growth of organic agricultural land by allocating a sum of IDR 2.3 billion. This funding will be utilized for seed subsidies, farmer help, certification

expenses, and provision of agricultural input aid (Sofya, 2019). The organic farming regions in Batu are located in the villages of Beji, Dadaprejo, Junrejo, Mojorejo, Pendem, Tlekung, and Torongrejo Village in Junrejo District, as documented. Batu District comprises Temas Village, Sisir Village, Pesanggrahan Village, and Sumberejo Village. In addition to Bumiaji District, which include the villages of Sumberbrantas, Tulungrejo, Sumbergondo, Bulukerto, Gunungsari, Pandanrejo, and Giripurno.

Throughout history, the Batu administration has engaged in numerous agricultural alliances, including partnerships with international entities such as sister cities. The Batu Government has established a Japanese-inspired agricultural strategy by collaborating with the Japanese government on a system development and trial project called "Furusato Edu Farm Organic Farming Development." The project covers an area of 7,800 square meters. The designed model is an ecologically sustainable agricultural sector featuring California Strawberry, Cherry Tomato, and Melon crops. With the objective of cultivating more flavorful and larger fruit (Sofya, 2019).

In addition to agriculture, animal husbandry plays a significant role in the city of Batu's economic activities. This is because some regions are used for the production of milk and have sizable populations of livestock, particularly dairy cows, which are the primary source of forage. The city of Batu is situated on a mountain slope with plenty of forested area that can be used to provide greenery and cool temperatures. Batu is renowned for its thriving livestock industry, with dairy cattle being the primary commodity and the key driver of its livestock business.

Batu will give priority to the empowerment of cattle, as it is a significant source of income in the city. During the Livestock Products Exhibition, Pujul Santoso, the Deputy Mayor of Batu, announced that the livestock farms in Batu are anticipated to form partnerships with the Tourism Office and Regional Apparatus Organizations (OPD). This initiative aims to enhance knowledge and understanding in the livestock industry (Rahman, 2018). Toyomerto is a village that provides fresh milk to industries located both inside and outside the city of Batu (Harun, 2018).

The livestock sector significantly contributes to the economy of Batu city, encompassing many scales of operations, ranging from small to large, including dairy cattle, beef cattle, goats, and sheep. This industry has experienced growth. East Java is projected to be the top producer of fresh milk in the country in 2021, with a total output of 558,758 tons. Batu is a city known for its thriving dairy industry, specifically in the production of milk from dairy animals. The abundance of farms in Batu City necessitates the implementation of land enhancement measures, such as ensuring the provision of adequate feed (Harlina, 2022). State Forestry Public Company (Perhutani) of Batu, in collaboration with a partnership model, allocates around 400 hectares of land for the cultivation of grass, with the aim of promoting improved animal management (Nurhasan, 2018). Data is available to regulate the health of cows in order to ensure that the population and the quality of milk produced align with the necessary standards.

Furthermore, Batu is implementing initiatives to enhance livestock production. The Batu City Agriculture Service, utilizing the 2021 APBD money from the Batu City Government, is constructing an integrated cow drum. The objective of constructing this pen is to enhance educational tourism related to cow's milk (Fajarwati, 2021). In besides serving as an instructional tour about cow's milk, the dairy milk production yields around 5,000

liters of pure milk each day. Subsequently, this milk is dispatched to PT. Indolakto Pasuruan and PT. Gioia Cheese Indonesia in Bali. Given the limited prevalence of cheese making in Batu City (Perdana, 2022).

In order to enhance the management of the agricultural and livestock sectors, the Batu Government has implemented domestic programs as well as collaborated with overseas cities, such as Western Australia. The collaboration commenced with a visit from the West Australian Government, represented by Jennir Mathews and Maharani Rahsilaputeri as Commissioner and Business Development Manager respectively, to the Batu Government. The Batu Government was represented by dr. Endang Tri Ningsih, who serves as the Assistant for Development and Welfare at the Batu City Government Regional Secretariat. The visit took place on October 16, 2018 (Diskominfo, 2019).

During the discussion, the West Australian Government acknowledged the existence of numerous commonalities in the issues and problem-solving methods. Consequently, the government took the initiative to develop a cooperative framework in the form of a map. This collaboration was centered on four specific areas: transportation, agriculture, livestock, and the deployment of smart-city. Within the realm of agricultural and animal husbandry, the focus lies on organic farming and sustainability, with an emphasis on ecologically conscious tourism that effectively integrates water conservation practices. Earlier, the Western Australian Government expressed their intention to identify the issues in Batu for analysis by specialists from Western Australia. The objective is to discover effective remedies and establish cooperative approaches that would be mutually beneficial (Diskominfo, 2019). Moreover, it is imperative to conduct a comprehensive assessment of the agricultural and livestock capabilities in Batu as the initial phase of the paradiplomacy endeavor.

## **Conceptual Framework**

### ***Paradiplomacy***

The term paradiplomacy gained prominence in Indonesia in 2010, with the implementation of regional autonomy policies. This concept pertains to the conduct of local or regional governments (sub-state actors) in engaging with foreign nations, including other sub-state actors, non-governmental organizations, or corporations, with the aim of advancing the mutual interests of all parties involved. Paradiplomacy, a concept that is relatively recent in Indonesia, was initially proposed by Panayotis Soldatos, a Basque scientist, during an academic dispute in the 1980s. Soldatos coined the term 'paradiplomacy' by combining 'parallel diplomacy'. In addition to Soldatos, Ivo Duchacek coined the term 'micro-diplomacy' in the 1990s (Mukti, 2013).

Paradiplomacy refers to the delegation of political power and administrative authority to sub-state actors for the purpose of conducting foreign relations, while still requiring the central government's endorsement. This is in accordance with the provisions of Law no. 24 of 2000 on International Agreements and Law no. 32 of 2004 on regional autonomy policies, which allow for collaboration with foreign countries (Mukti, 2015). Though its implementation is subject to central government regulations, paradiplomacy does not represent national interests; rather, it grants the government the authority to resolve issues or accomplish specific goals at the city/provincial level. This is in contrast to foreign policy with central government authority (state actor). Paradiplomacy takes the

shape of international cooperation between governments and businesses (GtoB, GtoG), as well as the establishment of sister city/province relationships at the sub-state actor level (Mukti, 2013).

According to Robert C. Keohane, paradiplomacy offers a solution to the impact of globalization on international relations. He argues that international relations no longer revolve solely around nation-states, but also involve interactions between states and non-state actors. Transnational interaction activities have several discernible impacts, including: (1) Modifications in the attitudes of individuals within each nation, (2) the increase of international diversity within networks, (3) The establishment of interdependence and reliance in transportation and the global economy, (4) The growing inclination of governments from specific countries to exert influence over other nations, and (5) The emergence of non-state actors (such as trade unions, multinational corporations, and transnational corporations) that introduce private foreign policies that may clash with state policies and interests (Nye & Keohane, 2010).

In Indonesia, paradiplomacy has a significant degree of legal autonomy. This was initially announced by President Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono at a speech to Australian businesses on March 11, 2010. He extended an invitation for them to engage in partnerships or investments with the governors or local governments of Indonesia. While international collaborations like sister cities have been occurring in Indonesia since 1960, the term paradiplomacy has gained significant recognition since 2010. The paradiplomacy component, when put into practice, mostly consists of non-political endeavors that are predominantly cultural in character. These endeavors involve the exchange of ideas, information, and cultural elements between countries and nations, with the aim of fostering mutual understanding. Consequently, paradiplomacy can be regarded as a manifestation of soft power (Mukti, 2013).

During the process of international cooperation, a total of 13 stages in order are undertaken, that includes: 1) Assessing the possibilities of different regions, 2) Compiling a comprehensive province/city profile that highlights the key industries that are primed for collaboration. 3) Disseminating the profile through the website or the Consulate General of the Republic of Indonesia/ Indonesian Embassy. 4) Determine the foreign collaborators. Typically, the local government extends invitations to academics or professional staff in order to obtain impartial assessments. 5) Initiate correspondence with foreign entities via the Indonesian Consulate General/Embassy to coordinate meetings. 6) Encounters among authorized personnel. If a suitable agreement for ongoing collaboration is found, you have the option to generate a Letter of Intent (LoI). 7) Assemble a negotiation team to compose a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) that extends to a comprehensive agreement. 8) Engaging in a discussion with the DPRD to obtain permission for the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU). In the event of disapproval, you have the option to seek an alternative partner or commence the process anew. 9) The Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) will be signed once the draft has been accepted. 10) Ensure that the technical team carries out specific tasks in a thorough manner by following up on the implementation of particular activities. 11) Developing the program/cooperation budget in alignment with the APBD. 12) Enactment of the partnership paradiplomacy, and 13) Assessment of the execution of foreign cooperation (Mukti, 2013).

This study focuses on the process of assessment between the administration of Batu City and Western Australia. Specifically, it examines the regional potential mapping conducted by Batu City and the resulting discussions held with authorized authorities to discuss and enhance collaboration.

## Method

The author will use descriptive-qualitative research for this research. In this circumstance, researchers aim to elucidate an issue for investigation by thoroughly examining the conditions, occurrences, and symptoms of certain groups, as well as analyzing empirical data (Sugiyono, 2013). The primary data comes from interviews conducted with the Government officials in Batu City, while the secondary data is obtained through document analysis, particularly publications that are reputable national or worldwide journals. This research aims to evaluate the period from 2018 to 2020 during which Batu City and Western Australia engaged in paradiplomacy activities. The assessment will include a discussion on cooperation, an analysis of Batu City's potential and obstacles, and the collection of relevant data pertaining to cooperation in the Agriculture Sector.

## Finding and Discussion

### **Mapping of Agricultural and Livestock Potential in Batu during 2018-2020**

Batu, being the highest city in East Java, is situated in a mountainous region, making it very suitable for agriculture and livestock farming. Based on statistics from the Central Statistics Agency (BPS) of Batu City and interviews with government workers of Batu City, the main areas of production strength include ornamental plants, medicinal plants, vegetables and fruits, as well as dairy production. Since the 1990s, the city of Batu has been the largest producer of cow's milk in East Java, distributing it to various cities in East Java as well as to Village Unit Cooperatives (KUD) in the Malang Raya region.

Table 1. Decorative Plants Production in Batu during 2018-2020  
(BPS Kota Batu, 2022b)

No.	Plant Species	2018	2019	2020
1	Orchid	2,354,872	2,150,733	1,673,296
2	Anthurium (Flower)	478,774	487,117	416,717
3	Anthurium (Leaf)	41,601	42,252	43,194
4	Carnation	363,708	341,402	209,776
5	Balanceng	26,000	26,100	33,550
6	Dracaena	41,365	31,950	22,290
7	Euphorbia	4,095	3,308	3,141
8	Gladiol	141,885	125,100	87,690
9	Hanjuang	21,648	21,340	14,234
10	Herbras	251,013	254,141	173,898
11	Adenium	2,738	2,332	2,024
12	Ornamental Caladiums	35,730	35,838	33,630
13	Chrysanthemum	38,744,000	39,305,208	21,980,908

14	Rose	101,134,739	116,053,650	55,488,590
15	Soka	6,714	4,150	1,800
16	Monstera	1,980	2,480	7,368
17	Aglaonema	156,751	160,566	165,389
18	Palm	29,900	21,119	11,811
19	Sansevieria	73,762	69,168	48,268
20	Philodendron	2,087,664	2,004,310	1,413,445
21	Heliconia	15,362	15,584	14,998

Table 1 demonstrates that roses, chrysanthemums, orchids, and philodendrons are the primary plant species cultivated for commercial purposes. Local purchasers have a strong hold on the market for roses and chrysanthemums, whilst the international market has a high demand for orchids and philodendrons. The domestic market for rose, chrysanthemum, and carnation plants is substantial, particularly for weddings, parties, and flower shops. However, a small fraction of these plants will also be sold internationally. Moreover, the philodendron plant is well regarded internationally for its dual purpose as both a decorative plant and an effective means of enhancing air quality. Additionally, it has the ability to elevate humidity levels and alleviate dry air within households, making it an ideal natural air humidifier, particularly in regions with distinct seasons (Setiawan, 2022).

Moreover, orchid plants have gained popularity in the international floriculture industry, particularly for purposes such as gardening, decorative services, and tourism. Indonesia currently holds the top position as the world's leading exporter of orchids, owing to its identification of 43,000 distinct varieties of indigenous orchids, each possessing unique traits. Japan and Singapore are among the primary importers of orchids from Indonesia, with demand projected to increase towards the end of the year (Asikin, 2019). In 2017, Indonesia exported a total of 43,000 kilograms of orchids, which increased to 55,000 kilograms in 2018. The orchid exports in 2019 amounted to IDR 2.49 trillion, with the USA, Japan, the Netherlands, South Korea, Vietnam, Canada, Britain, Brazil, and Germany being the nations where the shipments were sent. Batu City Perhutani and the Ministry of Agriculture persistently promote the cultivation of larger orchid plants (Asia Today, 2020).

Table 2. Biopharmaceutical Crop Production by Plant Type during 2018-2020 (Kg)  
(BPS Kota Batu, 2022a)

No.	Plant Type	2018	2019	2020
1	Aloe vera	48,000	34,024	22,372
2	Ginger	312,200	192,800	314,185
3	Curcuma	11,340	16,065	23,058
4	Turmeric	98,900	100,640	153,800
5	Galangal	18,900	16,800	18,929
6	<i>Kaempferiagalanga</i>	-	-	1,123
7	<i>Curcuma aeroginosa</i>	-	1,970	2,026

According to the data presented in table 2, ginger is the primary commodity for biopharmaceutical plants, followed by turmeric. Based on FAO data from 2017, global ginger consumption for domestic and therapeutic purposes amounts to 1.6 million tonnes annually

(Badan Pengkajian dan Pengembangan Perdagangan, 2017). Indonesia experienced an enormous rise in ginger production between 2016 and 2020, but it is anticipated to decrease in 2022. Although Indonesia is the leading producer of ginger, it is rated 19th globally in terms of ginger exports. These factors include global competitiveness, substandard product quality, production variability caused by unpredictable weather, and a lack of distinctiveness in the export of partially processed ginger goods (BSIP Kementerian Pertanian, 2023). Enhancing the quality of ginger through international cooperation could enable Batu to produce more of it at a level that is competitive with China, India, and Thailand.

Table 3. Annual Fruit Production According to Plant Type in Batu (Tons) during 2018-2020 (BPS Kota Batu, 2021)

No.	Fruit Species	2018	2019	2020
1	Avocado	55,652	57,232	58,022
2	Grape	129	124	9
3	Apple	545,320	505,254	231,764
4	Starfruit	91	82	132
5	Jackfruit	22,937	22,799	21,205
6	Durian	7,578	7,494	5,409
7	Watery Guava	299	228	180
8	Guava	24,804	24,487	25,637
9	Soursop	64	65	94
10	<i>Sukun</i>	3,285	3,263	3,127
11	Tangerine	222,177	238,436	197,996
12	Mango	753	700	771
13	Passion fruit	2	9	9
14	Papaya	1,144	1,111	1,229
15	<i>Petai</i>	97	97	64
16	Banana	10,633	9,789	7,857
17	Rambutan	61	62	-

According to Table 3, tangerines are the most abundant fruit grown in Batu, however, the primary consumer base consists of local residents. In contrast to the absence of data regarding kaffir lime in the table, it is worth noting that this particular type is actively exported to the Netherlands and France. In 2020, the export volume of kaffir lime to these two nations is projected to reach forty-eight tons per year, which is equivalent to a value of IDR eight billion per year. The Agricultural Technology Research and Assessment Installation (IP2TP) Balitjestro Punten, Batu City has developed a total of 271 different forms of lime, which has sparked interest in kaffir lime. President Joko Widodo is particularly focused on enhancing the production of high-quality seeds for export to European markets (Anam, 2021).



Table 4. Production of Livestock in Batu during 2018-2020  
(Source by BPS Kota Batu, treated by author)

No	Livestock	Meat (Ton)			Milk (Litre)			Egg (Ton)		
		2018	2019	2020	2018	2019	2020	2018	2019	2020
1	Beef cattle	282,720	396	362	0	-	-	-	-	-
2	Daily cow	44,640	73	77	23,984,354	22,323	24,558	-	-	-
3	Buffalo	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
4	Horse	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
5	Goat	107,315	114	93	33,620	30	30	-	-	-
6	Lamb	48,840	48	48	-	-	-	-	-	-
7	Pig	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
8	Laying pullet	100,300	106	91	-	-	-	1,461,428	350	1,401
9	Purebred	88,365	99	88	-	-	-	24,825	22	22
10	Broiler	1,479,000	1,372	1,281	-	-	-	0	1,426	0
11	Duck	29,500	42	37	-	-	-	80,456	42	35
12	Hare	12,300	11	10	-	-	-	-	-	-
13	Muscovy Duck	9,040	16	14	-	-	-	4,258	4	4

Table 4 illustrates that the most significant livestock production comprises broilers, laying pullets, and dairy milk. Batu is the primary provider of yogurt ingredients to multiple locations in East Java due to the extensive segmentation of the dairy milk market (Dinas Peternakan Jawa Timur, 2013). Unfortunately, the data indicates a substantial decrease in animal populations across all categories, primarily attributed to the prevalence of various diseases that afflict livestock. One such disease is Hoof Infectious Disease (PMK), which not only leads to a high mortality rate among cows but also hampers dairy milk production in Batu (Amarullah, 2023). The customary livestock farming system in Batu poses a potential danger to the livelihoods of the local community and the necessity for technological transfer in the livestock sector. Hence, fostering international collaboration with Western Australia presents a viable solution to address the diminishing quantity and quality of the livestock industry.

### Challenges and Opportunities for Batu City in International Collaboration with the Government of Western Australia.

The relationship of cooperation between the provinces of East Java and West Australia has been in place for a considerable duration, specifically since 1990. The motivation behind this collaboration stems from the existence of shared characteristics, administrative status, comparable positions, and mutually beneficial conditions in the domains of investment, agriculture, trade, and livestock (Wayan, 2013). The process of sister province cooperation between West Australia and East Java encompasses urban areas of all sizes, including both small towns and large metropolis. The city of Batu, located in East Java, has a thriving agricultural sector that significantly contributes to the economic growth of the region. This sector has a competitive advantage that has reached a value of 50 billion

rupiah. Additionally, the city of Batu possesses other competitive advantages in its agricultural sector. Specifically, the sectors referred to are the plantation and livestock industries (Kurniawan, 2017). This bilateral partnership between two regional governments from distinct nations seeks to foster the growth of the regional economy and is anticipated to enhance regional engagement in international cooperation.

West Australia and East Java have successfully implemented several collaborative initiatives, including agreements in potato trade, student diplomacy, student exchanges, dairy farming cooperation, technical cooperation in sports, the establishment of an inclusion study center, and collaboration between consortiums of state universities in West Australia and Java. The direction is east. Nevertheless, the purported collaboration in the domains of agriculture and livestock between West Australia and East Java in Batu City remains purely speculative, as there is a conspicuous absence of empirical data substantiating the progress of this partnership in these particular industries. Prior to this, there were negotiations held between the Western Australian government and the city of Batu discussing collaboration in several areas. Western Australia asserts that there are resemblances between the two regions in terms of the challenges encountered and the strategies employed to address these challenges. Western Australia has identified four key areas of focus in their cooperation plan. These areas include prioritizing organic and sustainable farming in the agriculture and livestock sector, promoting environmentally friendly tourism and integrated water conservation in transportation, implementing Smartcity initiatives, and offering additional programs such as the child road safety program and village energy (Diskominfo, 2019).

During the research, the researchers interviewed and collected data on the collaboration between Batu City and Western Australia in the agricultural and livestock sectors. The Batu City Government confirmed that there is no available data on this collaboration as it is still in the discussion phase and has not been finalized. Merely. This condition arises due to the cooperative forum being established between West Australia and East Java as sister provinces. Consequently, the implementation of cooperation in the city of Batu, which is located in East Java, necessitates a lengthier process. The efficacy or enhancement of a collaboration is contingent upon the existence of efficient bureaucracy and sufficient resources. In addition to that, the presence of financial resources, personnel, infrastructure, and efficient communication are crucial factors in the successful implementation of the cooperation policy (Wayan, 2013).

Nonetheless, the long-standing partnership between the sister provinces of East Java and West Australia, spanning over 33 years, has fostered extensive engagement with numerous stakeholders. The East Java government has formed a partnership with PT. Selectani Horticulture, which is situated in Batu City, within the agricultural industry. The company engages in the agribusiness sector, specifically focusing on activities such as flower and vegetable breeding, fertilization, and the production of F1 hybrid seeds for decorative plants and vegetables. This company's export market extends to Europe, with the primary destinations being the Netherlands, England, Germany, and France. Additionally, Thailand and Singapore serve as destination countries in Asia. The East Java province government's confidence in PT. Selectani Horticulture was further bolstered by its receipt of the Corporate Sustainability Award in 2009, its 3rd place ranking in the East Java province Exporter competition in 2014, and its 2nd place ranking in the Central Java Provincial Resilient

Exporter competition (Sugiarsono, 2018). Due to his notable accomplishments, the East Java Provincial government delegated this collaboration to the Batu City Government.

The Batu City Central Statistics Agency (BPS) conducted a plant mapping exercise, which resulted in the classification of plants based on their harvest period. These classifications include: (1) Seasonal vegetable and fruit plants that are harvested within a year, (2) Fruit plants and annual vegetables that are harvested annually, (3) Biopharmaceutical plants used for medicinal, cosmetic, and health purposes, (4) Decorative plants, (5) Harvested area, which refers to vegetables, fruit, biopharmaceutical plants, and ornamental plants that are harvested multiple times within a quarterly period, and (6) Production, which refers to the products derived from vegetables, fruit, biopharmaceutical plants, and ornamental plants, based on the harvested area each quarter (BPS Kota Batu, 2023).

The Batu City Government recognizes the significant potential for exporting decorative plants in Batu City, with 80% of the city's economic revenue being derived from the export of decorative plants, followed by vegetable and fruit chips (Shuvia, 2021). By 2022, the export of fruit and vegetable chips to ASEAN countries is projected to double, reaching a value of 17.5 billion rupiah. The government recognizes this as an opportunity to boost vegetable and fruit production, both for local consumption and for export. Nurbianto, the Head of the Trade Division of the Batu City Cooperatives, Micro Enterprises and Trade (Diskumdag) Department, aims to achieve an export value of 20 billion rupiah for vegetable and fruit chips by 2023. Additional oversight is required for the management and handling of decorative plants as well as fruits and vegetables in Batu (Wibowo, 2023).

The Batu Government view Western Australia, known for its importance in livestock and agriculture in Australia, as a viable solution to optimize the quality and quantity of the agricultural and animal industries. Batu's objectives encompass ensuring domestic food security, establishing sustainable farming practices, and augmenting export volumes to stimulate the local economy and enhance community welfare.

### ***Analysis of the Potential of Batu City in Initiating Foreign Cooperation with West Australia in the Agriculture and Livestock Sector***

From a paradiplomacy standpoint, the relationship between Batu City and Western Australia represents a significant milestone for the future advancement of Batu City. Batu City aims to enforce Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 25 of 2020, which includes Article 16 paragraph (1) governing the procedures for regional collaboration with foreign regional governments and overseas institutions. According to this regulation, any plan for regional cooperation with foreign regional governments must receive approval from the Regional People's Representative Council (DPRD) (Mukti, 2013). In addition, there are comprehensive protocols for engaging in foreign relations with regional governments, encompassing several forms of collaboration across multiple domains. The handbook further clarifies that the Department of Foreign Affairs serves as the Coordinator of the cooperation initiative. According to the guidelines, international cooperation is permissible as long as it does not contradict the politics and foreign policy of the Central Government. This implies that the cooperation must not pose a threat to domestic security (Thontowi, 2009).

However, further analysis should be conducted regarding the preparedness and capacity of Batu city to actualize this collaboration. This can be observed through the cooperative dynamics between Batu city and Western Australia, as previously mentioned in the discussion of the collaboration between Batu city and Australia. West Java is a collaborative effort between the governments of East Java and Western Australia. However, the issue arises due to the collaboration between the East Java Government and the West Australian Government, which includes the participation of various cities in East Java, including Batu. In this collaborative endeavor, the Batu City Government and Western Australia joined forces in four specific domains: transportation, agriculture, animal husbandry, and vocational education. However, this collaboration can be deemed unsuccessful as it did not progress beyond the initial discussion phase, lacking any subsequent development.

Various criteria were derived from interviews done with personnel from the Batu City Government, specifically the Head of the Animal Husbandry and Food Security Division, who happened to be the individual present during the cooperative conversations with the Australian Government. One of the reasons why the cooperation did not progress was due to the derivative cooperation between sister provinces, rather than sister cities. However, the collaboration between the city of Batu and West Australia was initiated by the East Java Government. The main obstacle lies in the coordination of communication between the Batu city government and the West Australian Government, which requires an intermediary from the East Java Government. This is also related to administrative difficulties in obtaining approval from the central government. As a result, the cooperation in the livestock and agriculture sector remains at the discussion stage.

From the standpoint of good governance, it is imperative for a country to establish a democratic political system that prioritizes the welfare of its citizens by adhering to universal democratic principles. This ensures that the government is capable of delivering high-quality services to the community across all aspects of life (Andi Nimah Sulfiani, 2021). UNDP identifies four fundamental characteristics of good governance, which are accountability, transparency, openness, and the rule of law. These values are essential for fostering a solid paradiplomacy (Sedarmayanti, 2009).

Unexpectedly Batu remains incapable of implementing these four principles. The primary issue is a deficiency in accountability, which refers to the obligation of individuals or groups entrusted with specific tasks to answer to the party that has given them authority, both in a hierarchical and lateral manner. According to the previous explanation, accountability is closely linked to the responsibility of an individual or a group for their acts. Within the scope of this study, the Batu City Government's responsibility in the collaboration with the Government of Western Australia in the agriculture and animal husbandry sector is evident. Based on conducted interviews, it is clear that the city of Batu bears full responsibility for the implementation of this cooperation. The city of Batu has made preparations to transition to the next phase. Moreover, this is evidenced by the communication with the central government, which persistently seeks authorization for collaborative efforts, including the signing of a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU). However, administrative hurdles imposed by the central authority pose significant challenges, ultimately preventing the realization of this collaboration, particularly in the domains of agriculture and animal husbandry (Mardiasmo, 2018).

Furthermore, the city government's deficiency in transparency is evident in its limited openness, lack of public interaction, and insufficient accessibility to various sources of information. Here, we observe the Batu City Government's commitment to transparency in providing comprehensive information on their collaboration with the West Australian Government. If the data is sourced from the Batu City Communication and Information Center on the internet, there is transparency in the form of a press release regarding the collaboration. However, the internet does not provide information on the continuity of the collaboration. This lack of information is seen as a shortcoming in Batu City, as it gives the impression that the collaboration only focuses on promoting or branding to the general public. The lack of clarity regarding the continuation of the cooperation makes this transparency ineffective. It is possible that the public is unaware of whether the cooperation is ongoing, particularly in the fields of agriculture and animal husbandry. Examining the components of transparency, namely openness, involvement, and convenience, it is evident that the elements of involvement and convenience may be satisfied. However, the elements of openness in this instance remain unfulfilled as the Batu City Government appears to be concealing certain information regarding this collaboration.

Furthermore, the absence of transparency hinders public engagement, preventing them from offering feedback and constructive criticism towards the administration. The Batu City Government should allocate a platform for public scrutiny of the sustainability of this collaboration. However, no criticism has arisen thus far due to the scarcity of information. This is because the collaboration is a derivative form of cooperation, which restricts the city of Batu from taking unilateral action. Consequently, a dilemma arises in the implementation process of this cooperation. In the domains of animal husbandry and agriculture, arrangements have been put in place. However, there is now a lack of administrative continuity from the central authority, resulting in a lack of collaboration. Consequently, the city of Batu is unable to transmit information pertaining to this topic. Researchers can utilize the data provided by the Batu city government, which includes the option for receiving criticism or responses. This collaboration is facilitated through the Batu city communications and information website, where users can leave comments on every published news story. However, it should be noted that there is currently no feedback from the city government. Researchers suggest that the city of Batu has made efforts to adhere to the principle of transparency, albeit with room for improvement.

The theory posits that the cooperation between Batu City and West Australia will cease in the agricultural and animal domains. It is evident that in the process of collaborating with other nations, this collaboration will halt at the third stage, namely the distribution of an inadequately updated city profile, which can impede partners from comprehending the city's potential. The Batu City Government should enhance the city profile website in order to attract collaboration from a broader spectrum of stakeholders. By implementing a paradiplomacy framework, our aim is to enhance both the caliber and quantity of products inside a certain region. This will enable us to satisfy local demands and facilitate exports to foreign nations, ultimately leading to an improved standard of living for the residents of the city/province (Mansyur, 2021).

## Conclusion

The Sister Province initiative, overseen by the East Java Regional Government in Batu City, has demonstrated a lack of performance in the domains of Agriculture. The collaboration between Batu City and Western Australia only progressed to the discussion level, as there was no further action taken to expand the cooperation in the areas of Agriculture until the signing of the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU). As a result, the paradiplomacy efforts conducted by East Java Province, particularly in the local administration of Batu City, are not progressing successfully. Although the collaboration between Batu City and the Overseas Regional Government holds promise for the future of Indonesia's diplomacy, it encountered a setback during the advanced stages when the cooperative discussions abruptly halted. Hence, in order to ensure the success of collaboration between regional governments and overseas regional governments, it is essential to prioritize the regional government and central government's commitment to exploring the international cooperation process, enhancing human resources in Indonesia, and fostering greater flexibility within the central bureaucracy to expedite the paradiplomacy process, thereby enhancing the capacity of the region.

## References

- Amarullah, K. (2023). Produksi Susu Sapi di Toyomerto-Brau, Kota Batu Turun Drastis. Retrieved from Radar Malang website: <https://radarmalang.jawapos.com/kota-batu/812967669/produksi-susu-sapi-di-toyomerto-brau-kota-batu-turun-drastis>
- Anam, C. (2021). Jeruk Purut Asal Kota Batu Berhasil Ekspor ke Eropa. Retrieved from Bisnis.com website: <https://surabaya.bisnis.com/read/20211019/532/1456171/jeruk-purut-asal-kota-batu-berhasil-ekspor-ke-eropa>
- Andi Nimah Sulfiani. (2021). Good Governance Penerapan Prinsip-Prinsip Good Governance dalam Pelayanan BPJS Kesehatan Di Kota Palopo. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 17(1), 95–116. <https://doi.org/10.52316/jap.v17i1.59>
- Asia Today. (2020). Fantastis, Nilai Ekspor Anggrek Indonesia Capai Rp2,49 Triliun pada 2019. Retrieved from Asia Today website: <https://asiatoday.id/read/fantastis-nilai-ekspor-anggrek-indonesia-capai-rp249-triliun-pada-2019>
- Asikin, M. N. (2019). Belum ada Pesaing Ekspor, Indonesia Lepas Dua Ribu Anggrek ke Jepang. Retrieved from Jawa Pos website: <https://www.jawapos.com/ekonomi/01233699/belum-ada-pesaing-ekspor-indonesia-lepas-dua-ribu-anggrek-ke-jepang>
- Badan Pengkajian dan Pengembangan Perdagangan. (2017). *Info Komoditi Tanaman Obat* (Pertama; Z. Salim & E. Munadi, Eds.). Jakarta: Badan Pengkajian dan Pengembangan Perdagangan.
- Badan Pusat Statistik, K. B. (n.d.). Populasi Ternak Dirinci Menurut Jenis Ternak di Kota Batu, 2015-2019.
- BPS Kota Batu. (2021). Produksi Buah-Buahan dan Sayuran Tahunan Menurut Jenis Tanaman di Kota Batu (Ton), 2018-2020. Retrieved from BPS Kota Batu website: <https://batukota.bps.go.id/statictable/2022/01/25/929/produksi-buah-buahan-dan-sayuran-tahunan-menurut-jenis-tanaman-di-kota-batu-ton-2018-2020.html>
- BPS Kota Batu. (2022a). Produksi Tanaman Biofarmaka Menurut Jenis Tanaman di Kota Batu, 2018- 2020. Retrieved from BPS Kota Batu website: <https://batukota.bps.go.id/statictable/2022/01/25/931/produksi-tanaman-biofarmaka-menurut-jenis-tanaman-di-kota-batu-2018--2020.html>
- BPS Kota Batu. (2022b). Produksi Tanaman Hias di Kota Batu Tahun 2018-2020. Retrieved from BPS Kota Batu website: <https://batukota.bps.go.id/statictable/2022/01/25/933/produksi-tanaman-hias-menurut-jenis-tanaman-di-kota-batu-m2-2018-2020.html>
- BPS Kota Batu. (2023). Pemetaan Tanaman Kota Batu. Retrieved from BPS Kota Batu website: <https://batukota.bps.go.id/subject/55/hortikultura.html#subjekViewTab1>
- BSIP Kementerian Pertanian. (2023). No Jahe: Potensi dan Tantangan Ekspor. Retrieved from BSIP Kementerian Pertanian website: <https://bisip.bsip.pertanian.go.id/berita/jahe-potensi-dan-tantangan-ekspor>
- Dinas Peternakan Jawa Timur. (2013). Tahukah Anda bahwa di Kota Batu Terdapat Rumah Yoghurt? Retrieved

- from Dinas Peternakan Jawa Timur website: <https://www.disnak.jatimprov.go.id/web/posts/read/997-tahukah-anda-bahwa-di-kota-batu-terdapat-rumah-yoghurt>
- Diskominfo, P. K. B. (2019). Kerjasama Australia Barat dengan Kota Batu Terus Dimatangkan.
- Fajarwati, F. (2021). November, Kota Batu Punya Sentra Kandang Sapi Terpadu.
- Hannyva, M. N. (2021). Geliat Paradiplomasi di Kota Wisata Batu.
- Harlina, N. (2022). Ternyata Jatim Penghasil Susu Sapi Tertinggi Di Indonesia, Apa Rahasiannya.
- Harun, H. (2018). *STRATEGI PEMERINTAH KOTA BATU DALAM MENGEMBANGKAN DESA WISATA PERAH SUSU SAPI (Studi pada Desa Wisata Pesanggrahan, Kecamatan Batu .... Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang.*
- Mansyur, A. R. (2021). Paradiplomasi Melalui Kerjasama Sister City: Upaya untuk Meningkatkan Potensi Industri Pariwisata di Kabupaten Sumenep. *Jurnal Wiraraja*, 16(1).
- Mardiasmo. (2018). Perpajakan Edisi Terbaru 2018. *Journal of Chemical Information and Modeling*.
- Mukti, T. A. (2013). *Paradiplomacy: Kerjasama Luar Negeri oleh Pemda di Indonesia (Pertama; A. Sahide, Ed.)*. Yogyakarta: The Phinisi Press Yogyakarta.
- Mukti, T. A. (2015). Paradiplomacy : Bangkitnya Aktor Lokal di Fora Internasional. *The POLITICS: Jurnal Magister Ilmu Politik Universitas Hasanuddin*, 1(1), 85–94. Retrieved from <https://journal.unhas.ac.id/index.php/politics/article/view/136/pdf>
- Nurhasan, F. M. (2018). *Analisis Potensi Kecukupan dan Daya Tampung Pakan ternak (Carriying Capaity) Di Kota Batu* (Vol. 66). Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang.
- Nye, J. S., & Keohane, R. O. (2010). Transnational Relations and World Politics : An Introduction. *International Organization*, 25(3), 329–349. Retrieved from [https://edisciplinas.usp.br/pluginfile.php/364783/mod\\_resource/content/1/keohane-nye\\_1971.pdf](https://edisciplinas.usp.br/pluginfile.php/364783/mod_resource/content/1/keohane-nye_1971.pdf)
- Perdana, N. (2022). Wisata Edukasi Susu Sapi Perah di Kota Batu.
- Pratiwi, D. P. (2018). *Evaluasi Program Pertanian Organik Kota Wisata Batu (Studi Kasus Komoditas Seledri, Buncis, Andewi Organik Di Desa Sumberejo Dan Kelurahan Temas Kecamatan Batu)*. Universitas Brawijaya.
- Radar Malang. (2023). Lahan Pertanian di Kota Batu Berkurang 100 Hektare Lebih. Retrieved from Radar Malang website: <https://radarmalang.jawapos.com/kota-batu/811091579/lahan-pertanian-di-kota-batu-berkurang-100-hektare-lebih>
- Rahman, M. dani. (2018). Kota Batu Prioritaskan Peternakan.
- Sedarmayanti. (2009). *Membangun Sistem Manajemen Kinerja Guna Meningkatkan Produktivitas Menuju Good Governance (Kepemerintahan yang Baik )*. Bandung: penerbit mandar maju.
- Setiawan, S. R. D. (2022). 8 Manfaat Meletakkan Tanaman Philodendron di dalam Ruangan. Retrieved from Kompas.com website: <https://www.kompas.com/homey/read/2022/01/17/075300776/8-manfaat-meletakkan-tanaman-philodendron-di-dalam-ruangan?page=all>
- Shuvia, R. (2021). Tanaman Hias Dominasi Ekspor Kota Batu. Retrieved from Radar Malang website: <https://radarmalang.jawapos.com/ekonomi-bisnis/811080770/tanaman-hias-dominasi-ekspor-kota-batu>
- Sofya, A. (2019). Luas Areal Pertanian Organik di Kota Batu Bertambah Jadi 20 Kawasan.
- Sugiarsono, J. (2018). Selektani Induk Usaha, Jagoan Ekspor Benih Hortikultura. Retrieved from swa.co.id website: <https://swa.co.id/business-champions/companies/best-exporter/selektani-induk-usaha-jagoan-ekspor-benh-hortikultura>
- Sugiyono. (2013). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan RnD* (Pertama). Bandung: Penerbit Alfabeta.
- Thontowi, J. (2009). Kewenangan Daerah Dalam Melaksanakan Hubungan Luar Negeri (Studi Kasus Di Propinsi Jawa Barat Dan Diy ). *Jurnal Hukum Ius Quia Iustum*, 16(2), 149–168. <https://doi.org/10.20885/iustum.vol16.iss2.art1>
- Wibowo, A. (2023). Kota Batu Targetkan Angka Ekspor Tembus Rp20 Miliar. Retrieved from Malang Post website: <https://malang-post.com/2023/08/27/kota-batu-targetkan-angka-ekspor-tembus-rp20-miliar/>