



Madrasah diniyah teachers' perceptions on the tajwid recitation program's implementation: A post-training qualitative study

Yusuf Hanafi ^{a,1}, Faris Khoirul Anam ^{a,2}, Muhammad Saefi ^{b,3}, M. Alifudin Ikhsan ^{c,4,*}, Tsania Nur Diyana ^{d,5}

^a Department of Arabic, Faculty of Letters, Universitas Negeri Malang, Jl. Semarang No. 5 Malang, East Java 65145, Indonesia

^b Biology Study Program, Faculty of Science and Technology, Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim, Jl. Gajayana No. 50 Malang, East Java 65144, Indonesia

^c Universitas Brawijaya, Jl. Veteran No. 1 Malang, East Java 65145, Indonesia

^d Department of Physics Education, Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Jl. Colombo Yogyakarta No. 1, Sleman, Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta 55281, Indonesia

¹ yusuf.hanafi.fs@um.ac.id; ² faris.fs@um.ac.id; ³ muhammadsaefi@bio.uin-malang.ac.id; ⁴ um.alifudin93@gmail.com*; ⁵ tsanianurdiyana@uny.ac.id

* Corresponding author

ARTICLE INFO	ABSTRACT
<p>Article history Received: 2023-09-11 Revised: 2023-09-18 Accepted: 2023-09-23 Published: 2023-09-25</p> <p>Keywords Madrasah Diniyah Perceptions Recitation Tajwid Teacher</p>	<p><i>Formative assessment is often neglected in learning. This study investigates the perception of madrasah diniyah teachers on the planned implementation of the recitation program as part of a formative evaluation in the form of feedback. Twenty madrasah diniyah teachers were asked to respond to a questionnaire that covered three aspects, namely planning, learning outcomes, and teacher support in the post-training. The findings show that teachers have an open view of the implementation of recitation and believe that it can provide significant benefits for student learning outcomes. This paper provides empirical insight into teacher perceptions and provides suggestions for expanding teacher understanding and competence in utilizing recitation programs as an integral element of recitation learning methods and evaluations.</i></p>
<p>Kata Kunci Guru Madrasah Diniyah Pembacaan Persepsi Tajwid</p>	<p>Persepsi guru madrasah diniyah terhadap implementasi program resitasi tajwid: Studi kualitatif pasca pelatihan. Asesmen formatif seringkali diabaikan dalam pembelajaran. Penelitian ini mengkaji bagaimana persepsi guru madrasah diniyah terhadap rencana pelaksanaan program resitasi Tajwid sebagai bagian dari evaluasi formatif berupa umpan balik. Dua puluh guru madrasah diniyah diminta untuk merespon angket yang meliputi tiga aspek, yakni perencanaan, hasil belajar, dan dukungan guru pada pasca pelatihan. Temuan menunjukkan bahwa guru mempunyai pandangan yang terbuka terhadap implementasi resitasi Tajwid dan meyakini dapat memberikan keuntungan yang signifikan bagi hasil belajar siswa. Artikel ini memberikan wawasan empiris tentang persepsi guru, dan memberikan saran untuk memperluas pemahaman dan kompetensi guru dalam memanfaatkan program resitasi sebagai elemen integral dari metode dan evaluasi pembelajaran Tajwid.</p>

Copyright © 2023, Hanafi et al
This is an open access article under the CC-BY-SA



How to cite: Hanafi, Y., Anam, F. K., Saefi, M., Ikhsan, M. A., & Dinaya, T. N. (2023). Madrasah diniyah teachers' perceptions on the tajwid recitation program's implementation: A post-training qualitative study. *Journal of Community Service and Empowerment*, 4(3), 522-529. <https://doi.org/10.22219/jcse.v4i3.29202>

INTRODUCTION

Learning assessment has become the main focus of educational researchers in the last few decades (Stiggins, 2005). Assessment is considered an appropriate way to improve student learning experiences (Black et al., 2003). Apart from that, the existence of disturbances and uncertainties during the learning process is considered to be able to be resolved with learning assessments (Schon, 1984). Assessment is a process that must be carried out continuously to help students increase their motivation and experience (Harlen, 2005, 2012; Stiggins, 2005). To achieve this goal, researchers suggest

teachers carry out formative assessments in the form of feedback. Formative assessment is an important part of the learning process because it can inform teachers of teaching strategies and methods (Harlen, 2005; Stiggins, 2005). This tendency to ignore the role of assessment can influence the learning strategies and content design implemented by teachers in the classroom (Harlen, 2005).

In the context of Madrasah Diniyah level, the number of teaching hours for Tajwid subjects is considered to still have a small and limited proportion of teaching hours. On the other hand, there is no formative assessment in the classical learning system implemented by teachers. In other words, neglect of formative assessments has been a long-standing problem that has not been properly addressed. This condition has caused a problem where students are less able to read the Quran according to the rules of recitation. This is proven by the initial evaluation results, which show less than encouraging results where students still experience misconceptions about the recitation material. Discrepancies in students' concepts and understanding need to be corrected immediately, one of which is by providing exercises and learning modules outside of class through recitations. This also really supports conditions where recitation learning hours are still limited.

Recitations are interpreted as students' conceptual deepening exercises outside of class hours on material that they still have difficulty with when taught in class (Docktor & Mestre, 2014). Recitations are given to students in the form of practicing conceptual questions on certain topics and are accompanied by informative feedback. This exercise will help students when learning by verifying the correctness of the concepts they have previously understood, whether they are appropriate or whether they have misconceptions (Oliveira & Oliveira, 2013). After students practice through conceptual questions along with feedback, they are expected to be able to construct a correct understanding regarding the recitation material and no longer experience difficulties. As several studies have reported success in increasing students' mastery of concepts and overcoming misconceptions experienced through recitation programs (Koenig et al., 2007; Ogilvie, 2009). In general, the recitation program places great emphasis on formative assessment in the form of informative feedback.

In various literature, feedback is proven to improve learning outcomes because it covers various aspects. It is not only relational between teachers and students, but also includes emotional aspects (Carless et al., 2011; Pitt & Norton, 2017; Small & Attree, 2016). Based on psycho-social aspects, providing feedback is recognized as very important (Ajjawi & Boud, 2017; Boud & Molloy, 2013). General feedback can provide information regarding student understanding (Hattie & Timperley, 2007). Thus, positive results will be obtained if the feedback provided is informative, specific, goal-related, and not expressed in judgmental language (Van der Kleij et al., 2015), as is done in the recitation program. Previous research has also shown that feedback can improve students' self-regulation abilities which have an impact on improving performance and learning outcomes (Fonseca et al., 2015).

Although recitation is believed to help students learn recitation, teachers must have significant knowledge to practice it. With the assistance provided during the community service process, teachers will of course gain sufficient knowledge to apply it in their classes. However, knowledge about recitation is not enough to ensure that teachers will act responsively according to students' problems and needs. If teachers do not see the potential of implementing this recitation, then the effect of implementing this program will also be limited (Wilson, 2005). In line with this, research conducted by Tsai shows that some teachers do not perceive the potential insights of new teaching approaches because of their successful experiences in existing practices (Tsai, 2006). In other words, newly acquired concepts tend not to be retained as strongly as their perceptions of previous teaching methods.

In general, a number of pieces of literature point to the statement that teachers' personal perceptions have a major influence on the teaching and assessment carried out in the classroom. For this reason, teachers' perceptions of the implementation of tajwid recitation should be explored in order to support teachers in implementing recitation practices. This research aims to explore teachers' perceptions on the adoption of recitation of tajwid as a formative assessment for learning tajwid. Apart from that, this research was also encouraged because qualitative research involving teacher perceptions of changes and new ways in recitation classes had not been reported.

This article refers to data from community service that has been carried out to help Madrasah Diniyah teachers implement recitation to promote assessment for learning in recitation classes. This is one of the earliest attempts to study the application of recitation at the Islamic school level which has been introduced into the science curriculum. The influence of teachers' initial perceptions of teaching and learning on the application of recitation as a tool to achieve assessment for learning is the focus of this research.

METHOD

The recitation program as a learning method that emphasizes informative, targeted and specific feedback is considered to be able to help students master the expected abilities. With the aim of supporting Madrasah Diniyah teachers to increase their knowledge about the application of recitation and supporting them to use recitation as a means of assessment for learning in recitation lessons, teachers were given workshops which were given in two phases. Phase 1 carried out training on the Tahsin-Tilawah learning model based on Talqin-Taqlid covering material on (1) makharij al-huruf and the law of reading qolqolah; (2) the law of reading mim sukun and nun sukun; (3) the law of mad reading. This training is focused on providing refresher skills in reading the Al-Quran according to correct tajwid rules. Phase 2 carried

out training on the implementation of the Tajwid recitation program using the Tajwid Diagnostic Test (TDT) to find out any misconceptions in the science of Tajweed and solve the problem. The research team also provided intensive support to help reduce technical difficulties that prevented teachers from practicing recitations. After this two-phase workshop, teachers were asked to develop several question items as examples of compiling recitation material. Throughout the workshop, the research team worked closely with participating teachers to provide professional consultation on drafting, planning, and implementing recitations.

This research was conducted after the two training phases were completed (Figure 1) and before the implementation of the tajwid recitation program in their classes. Teachers who participate in the implementation of tajwid recitation are expected to facilitate students in improving their ability to read the Al-Qur'an. As in research conducted by Mui So dan Hoi Lee (2011), The research team adopted a constructivist view that teachers can develop new knowledge about the implementation of tajweed recitation after receiving training.



Figure 1. Tajwid recitation training participants

After the teachers attended the workshop, and before the recitation program was implemented in classroom practice, they were asked to provide responses to understand their perceptions of the recitation implementation. Through the responses given in an open questionnaire (Table 1), this research seeks to identify teachers' perceptions about the tajwid recital program that will be implemented in the classroom. The questions given in the questionnaire are open-ended and focus on three aspects, namely developing, implementing and using recitation programs, learning outcomes and teacher support. These three aspects were adapted from Mui So and Hoi Lee (Mui So & Hoi Lee, 2011).

Table 1. List of open questionnaire questions

No	Questions
1	How do you implement recitation learning in school/class? What strategies/methods are usually applied?
2	After receiving a 'workshop' in this Abdimas (community service) activity, how can you develop and implement a tajwid recital program?
3	According to you, do students easily learn Tajweed? What problems do you usually encounter?
4	In your opinion, what kind of improvement in learning outcomes can students achieve by implementing tajwid recitation?
5	What strategies might you apply so that students can easily participate in the Tajwid recital program?
6	In your opinion, what problems might students face in implementing this tajwid recitation program? What support can you provide regarding this problem?
7	Do you have any other ideas about strategies that can help students learn recitation easily? What needs to be improved about this recitation program so that students can follow the learning process more easily?

Participants consisted of 20 Islamic school teachers in Wagir District, Malang Regency and were conducted at SMP Darul Faqih Indonesia and SMP Sunan Giri Wagir. Madrasah Diniyah teachers were chosen because they are considered

to be the spearhead and front guard in teaching children about reading the Koran, on the other hand they are still laypeople in terms of modern learning, especially learning assessment. These participants offer a fairly representative sample because they come from various schools from different and diverse backgrounds located in Wagir District, Malang Regency.

Data analysis is generally carried out in two stages. First, the responses given by the teacher on the questionnaire are written word for word. Next, the main researcher and colleagues read repeatedly independently. Second, the data is then reviewed and coded according to predetermined categories. In other words, the analysis is carried out deductively and places it into predetermined questions and aspects. The entire coding process was carried out with the help of nVIVO 12 software. To ensure accuracy in interpretation, direct quotes from participants are also presented in the results section (Creswell, 2014). At the data analysis stage, agreement between researchers who carry out coding independently is also calculated (intercoder reliability). Agreement reached over 75% and has reached the required threshold. All differences in coding were resolved through discussion between the principal investigator and colleagues. To ensure the results obtained, the team also carried out member checks by giving several teachers the opportunity to clarify their comments or responses.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Twenty Madrasah Diniyah teachers were asked to respond to an open questionnaire and, a transcript of the results was carried out producing approximately 20 pages of 7 question points. A total of 12 meaning units are recorded for the recitation program of Tajwid. Themes are classified according to three factors that have been determined deductively, namely aspects of developing, implementing, and using recitation programs (Table 2), learning outcomes (Table 3), and teacher support (Table 4).

Develop, implement, and use a recitation program

In this first theme, three sub-themes were obtained, namely learning recitation in general, the methods used, and plans for implementing/applying recitations (Figure 2). From the responses given by the teacher, information was obtained that learning Tajwid is usually done by introducing theory, giving examples, imitating, repeating and memorizing. The methods most often used are the UMMI and Iqro' methods which are carried out classically. The advantage of the iqro method is that students can learn actively and systematically, and it is easy for teachers to monitor progress. Still, the disadvantage is that students need help understanding the names of letters and how to read, according to Tajweed (Wahyudin et al., 2023) . The Ummi method has advantages, such as being easy to understand and use, while the disadvantages are that it cannot be taught by the uncertified Ummi method (Firdaus, 2021). Meanwhile, for the application of Tajweed recitation, most teachers agree that the role of media such as websites provides a promising offer to make it easier for students to learn Tajweed through recitation. More detailed examples of responses given by teachers are presented in Table 2.

Table 2. Developing, Implementing, and Using a Recitation Program

Sub-themes from the context of the current study	Example of a response from a teacher
Tajwid learning in general	"In recitation classes, I usually only introduce the theory, for example the law of reading, and then they are asked to read it over and over again and memorize it." "The learning that we apply usually coincides with learning the Koran by giving examples and asking students to imitate what I exemplify."
Method used	"The methods that we often apply in teaching students are the iqro', UMMI, yanbua methods" "Other methods that I usually use are discussions or questions and answers regarding theory, giving quizzes, or reading and writing." "The strategy that is usually used is classical learning by reading together, but there are times when students are asked to read in turns so that students can be identified who are not yet able to read the Al-Qur'an correctly."
Recitation implementation plan	"I am very interested in this tajwid recitation program and want to use it with the help of the website" "The application of tajwid recitation will be able to provide a higher effect by using media that makes it easier for children to understand the material"



Figure 2. delivery of the resource person's contents

Learning outcomes

In this learning outcomes theme, two sub-themes were obtained, namely the obstacles faced by teachers in learning recitation and the expected learning outcomes from implementing recitation. Based on the responses given by teachers, the obstacles faced are very diverse, ranging from time, limited number of teachers, student learning focus, lack of family role, and characteristics of recitation learning itself. By implementing Tajweed recitation, it is hoped that it will be able to raise learning motivation so that students can more easily understand Tajweed material, moreover, this application also has the potential to be applied at home with parental assistance. Based on these results, teachers realize that there are many challenges they face, where the lack of parental role is considered to influence student learning outcomes significantly. The presence of tajwid recitation can increase parental assistance more efficiently. More detailed examples of responses given by teachers are presented in Table 3.

Table 3. Learning outcomes

Sub-themes from the context of the current study	Example of a response from a teacher
Constraint	"Time is very limited, while there are still only a few teachers" "Students lack focus in learning, and rarely even participate in learning" "Lack of family role in helping students read the Koran at home" "Usually students have difficulty with several letters that are difficult to distinguish, for example, Tsa, Sya, Sa"
Increasing learning outcomes with recitation	"At least it can increase student motivation so that their participation is even higher in class" "Improved learning outcomes are better because students feel happy in learning" "Of course, the expected learning outcome is an understanding of the concept of recitation and its application" "Student learning outcomes will increase with tajwid recitation because it can make it easier for parents to accompany students while studying at home"

Teacher support

In the teacher support theme, three sub-themes were obtained, namely general support, support for problems to be faced, and support for other strategies. Based on the responses given by the teacher, general support can be provided by combining recitation learning with previously used methods. Some obstacles such as limited internet support must involve parents. The problem of learning demotivation experienced by students can be overcome by implementing interesting recitations. Apart from that, video tutorials also need to be provided to make it easier for students to take part in the Tajwid recitation program. More detailed examples of responses given by teachers are presented in Table 4.

The main aim of this research is to explore the perceptions of Madrasah Diniyah teachers regarding informative feedback through the recitation program in recitation learning. Many studies have suggested recitation programs as an appropriate support for providing positive feedback (Koenig et al., 2007; Ogilvie, 2009). Through two workshop phases carried out in community service activities, the research team tried to provide support to teachers to increase their understanding and apply it in the classroom. This research also includes practical insights based on teachers' views on how formative evaluation can be implemented in the classroom through constructive and effective feedback to improve student learning outcomes. Because this research is exploratory in nature, the methodology used in this research is designed to enable teachers to articulate more descriptively how teachers can plan recitation programs, also related to the learning outcomes that will be obtained and the support that can be provided by teachers.

Table 4. Teacher support

Sub-themes from the context of the current study	Example of a response from a teacher
General support	"In the current situation, support by building a website is the right step" "Combining with previously run programs"
Support for problems encountered	"The problem that may occur when using the website is the internet infrastructure so it must be ensured that this support is there by involving parents" "The recitation program must be really well designed because demotivation is always a major problem"
Support in the form of other strategies	"There needs to be additional theories, not just evaluation and feedback" "Form a study group by combining children who have not yet and are able to master recitation" "It is necessary to provide tutorials in the form of videos about Tajwid recitation so that students can practice it more easily"

The main results of this analysis reinforce three perceptions that support the recitation program. First, Madrasah Diniyah teachers still maintain old views on teaching methods that have long been used in the classroom (Figure 3). However, it is not as stated by Tsai that teachers often do not accept new teaching approaches because of their successful experiences in existing practices (Tsai, 2006). The Madrasah Diniyah teachers involved in this research tried to be open and accept tajwid recitation as something new and planned to combine it with the methods that had been applied. This might be considered to make it easier for them to implement the tajwid recitation program in class. Second, Madrasah Diniyah teachers assess that the Tajwid recitation program has a number of advantages that are able to overcome a number of problems currently being faced, namely increasing student motivation and making it easier to study at home with parental assistance. Diniyah madrasah teachers believe that the implementation of tajwid recitation can improve student learning outcomes. Third, Madrasah Diniyah teachers consider that the Tajwid recitation program still needs other support such as a website. Teachers assess that the Tajwid recitation program is more significant if it is presented in the form of a learning website. However, there are several obstacles faced such as internet infrastructure. This problem is common when learning requires internet support. Referring to the explanation (Zhang, 2022), the mechanism or tactics that teachers can implement to help students progress in Tajweed abilities is to provide a recitation program as a quiz at home after students have studied with traditional methods in the class. Students can feel the benefits of web-based learning and increase their motivation to engage more with this learning media.



Figure 3. The community service team provides tajwid recitation training

Although this research provides significant results, the research results only provide partial understanding because only the teacher's perspective is sought and does not involve students. Additionally, this research was conducted before the implementation of recitations so the results may be less holistic about how teachers view the implementation of recitations, and it is unclear whether sentiment remains constant if teachers are asked similar questions after successfully implementing recitations. Apart from that, in a typical classroom such as Al-Qur'an learning which is generally teacher centered, the teacher usually does not have much one-on-one time to provide this feedback and it is mostly done classically. Future empirical observations may expand our understanding of how teachers conduct formative evaluation effectively in large class sizes with the aid of recitation programs.

CONCLUSION

This research contributes to the literature by articulating the perceptions of Madrasah Diniyah teachers who have experience in teaching recitation. First, the teacher has an open view and intends to combine recitation with old learning patterns to improve student learning outcomes. Second, teachers are of the view that implementing tajwid provides a number of benefits related to student attitudes by overcoming student demotivation and limited study time. Third, teachers assess that the implementation of tajwid recitation requires additional support, for example by developing a website that is attractive and easy to operate. Thus, the results of this research provide greater clarity for further community service activities in terms of how the implementation of tajwid recitation can be implemented at the madrasah diniyah level and in new contexts, namely in Al-Qur'an learning and why this implementation can have an impact on the quality of learning and outcomes student learning.

In addition, the findings here need to be read with caution because they do not have cross-disciplinary verification, especially as recitation programs are widely proven in the field of science education. Thus, we suggest our research has several practical implications for early madrasah teachers. To maintain student participation and motivation, teachers must be intentional and look for opportunities to implement recitation programs amidst old views that are still strong. However, with the current limited understanding and experience of Madrasah Diniyah teachers regarding the application of this recitation, teachers may need support in the form of further assistance in ongoing community service. In other words, because formative evaluation through recitation is just emerging in the context of Islamic religious education, especially in learning the Koran, we propose a research path.

This research process involves a number of steps that have the potential to cause bias in the conclusions the author wants to draw regarding teachers' views on the implementation of tajwid recitation and its impact on student learning outcomes. Although the focus is on exploring perspectives, these findings can be replicated more widely in an effort to understand tajweed recitation learning practices more comprehensively by paying attention to a number of limitations and the following suggestions. First, because this is the first to explore teachers' perceptions of the implementation of recitation among teachers with almost the same character at one time (one shot), it would be best to conduct similar interviews with teachers who have different educational qualifications and abilities, at different periods such as at the beginning, middle, and end semester, to ascertain whether the results would differ from these findings. Second, we did not observe the implementation of teaching carried out by teachers, so in the future, it is necessary to carry out empirical research that investigates teacher classroom observations to document the occurrence of formative evaluations of students with diverse backgrounds. This knowledge is believed to improve the quality of learning in recitation classes. In other words, empirical research that compares students and teachers with various abilities is also necessary to provide valuable information regarding what things should be considered apart from the impact of providing tajwid. Third, because there is currently no validated evaluative tool to measure how the application of tajwid impacts student learning outcomes and attitudes, the development of such an instrument will provide researchers with greater access to insights into the application of tajwid in the new context of religious education.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

We are very grateful to the Research and Community Service Institute (LP2M) of the State University of Malang (UM) for providing funding and SMP Darul Faqih Indonesia and SMP Sunan Giri Wagir as a partner in implementing this community service activity.

REFERENCES

- Ajjawi, R., & Boud, D. (2017). Researching feedback dialogue: An interactional analysis approach. *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education*, 42(2), 252–265. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02602938.2015.1102863>
- Black, P., Harrison, C., Lee, C., Marshall, B., & William, D. (2003). *Assessment for Learning- putting it into practice*. Open university Press. <http://www.mcgraw-hill.co.uk/html/0335212972.html>
- Boud, D., & Molloy, E. (2013). Rethinking models of feedback for learning: The challenge of design. *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education*, 38(6), 698–712. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02602938.2012.691462>
- Carless, D., Salter, D., Yang, M., & Lam, J. (2011). Developing sustainable feedback practices. *Studies in Higher Education*, 36(4), 395–407. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03075071003642449>
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches* (4th edition). SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Docktor, J. L., & Mestre, J. P. (2014). Synthesis of Discipline-Based Education Research in Physics. *Physical Review Special Topics - Physics Education Research*, 10(2). <https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevSTPER.10.020119>
- Firdaus, F. (2021). Implementation of the Ummi Method in Recognition of the Hijaiyyah Letters on Students of TKIT Nur Hikmah (Kindergarten) Bekasi during the Covid-19 Pandemic. *Basic and Applied Education Research Journal*, 2(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.11594/baerj.02.02.01>

- Fonseca, S. C., Pinheiro, R., Barbosa, C., Araújo, A., Vaz-Velho, M., & Alves, R. (2015). Food innovation and entrepreneurship in higher education: A case study. *International Journal of Food Studies*, 4(2), Article 2. <https://doi.org/10.7455/ijfs/4.2.2015.a3>
- Harlen, W. (2005). Teachers' summative practices and assessment for learning – tensions and synergies. *The Curriculum Journal*, 16(2), 207–223. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09585170500136093>
- Harlen, W. (2012). The Role of Assessment in Developing Motivation for Learning. In *Assessment and Learning* (pp. 171–184). SAGE Publications Ltd. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781446250808.n11>
- Hattie, J., & Timperley, H. (2007). The Power of Feedback. *Review of Educational Research*, 77(1), 81–112. <https://doi.org/10.3102/003465430298487>
- Koenig, K. M., Endorf, R. J., & Braun, G. A. (2007). Effectiveness of different tutorial recitation teaching methods and its implications for TA training. *Physical Review Special Topics - Physics Education Research*, 3(1), 010104. <https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevSTPER.3.010104>
- Mui So, W. W., & Hoi Lee, T. T. (2011). Influence of teachers' perceptions of teaching and learning on the implementation of Assessment for Learning in inquiry study. *Assessment in Education: Principles, Policy & Practice*, 18(4), 417–432. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0969594X.2011.577409>
- Ogilvie, C. A. (2009). Changes in students' problem-solving strategies in a course that includes context-rich, multifaceted problems. *Physical Review Special Topics - Physics Education Research*, 5(2), 020102. <https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevSTPER.5.020102>
- Oliveira, P. C., & Oliveira, C. G. (2013). Using conceptual questions to promote motivation and learning in physics lectures. *European Journal of Engineering Education*, 38(4), 417–424. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03043797.2013.780013>
- Pitt, E., & Norton, L. (2017). 'Now that's the feedback I want!' Students' reactions to feedback on graded work and what they do with it. *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education*, 42(4), 499–516. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02602938.2016.1142500>
- Schon, D. A. (1984). *The Reflective Practitioner: How Professionals Think In Action* (1st edition). Basic Books.
- Small, F., & Attree, K. (2016). Undergraduate student responses to feedback: Expectations and experiences. *Studies in Higher Education*, 41(11), 2078–2094. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03075079.2015.1007944>
- Stiggins, R. (2005). From Formative Assessment to Assessment for Learning: A Path to Success in Standards-Based Schools. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 87(4), 324–328. <https://doi.org/10.1177/003172170508700414>
- Tsai, C.-C. (2006). Biological knowledge is more tentative than physics knowledge: Taiwan high school adolescents' views about the nature of biology and physics. *Adolescence*, 41(164), 691–703.
- Van der Kleij, F. M., Feskens, R. C. W., & Eggen, T. J. H. M. (2015). Effects of Feedback in a Computer-Based Learning Environment on Students' Learning Outcomes: A Meta-Analysis. *Review of Educational Research*, 85(4), 475–511. <https://doi.org/10.3102/0034654314564881>
- Wahyudin, Y., Syairozi, I., & Qutub, S. (2023). Iqro Method A Quick Way To Learn To Read The Holly Al-Qur'an. *JIM: Jurnal Ilmiah Mahasiswa Pendidikan Sejarah*, 8(3), Article 3. <https://doi.org/10.24815/jimps.v8i3.26418>
- Wilson, D. S. (2005). Evolution for Everyone: How to Increase Acceptance of, Interest in, and Knowledge about Evolution. *PLOS Biology*, 3(12), e364. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pbio.0030364>
- Zhang, X. (2022). Demystifying the challenges of university students' web-based learning: A qualitative case study. *Education and Information Technologies*, 27(7), 10161–10178. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-022-10974-0>